

VU Research Portal

Plant Traits and Production Rates from CO2 Starvation to Saturation

Temme, A.A.

2016

document version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

citation for published version (APA)

Temme, A. A. (2016). *Plant Traits and Production Rates from CO2 Starvation to Saturation*. [, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam]. CPI-Koninklijke Wöhrmann.

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

E-mail address:

vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl



References

- Aerts R, Chapin FS (2000) The mineral nutrition of wild plants revisited: A re-evaluation of processes and patterns. In: *Advances In Ecological Research*, VOL 30, Vol. 30 (ed Fitter, AH and Raffaelli, DG), pp. 1–67. Elsevier Academic Press Inc, 525 B Street, Suite 1900, San Diego, CA 92101-4495 USA.
- Ainsworth EA, Rogers A (2007) The response of photosynthesis and stomatal conductance to rising [CO₂]: mechanisms and environmental interactions. *Plant, cell & environment*, **30**, 258–70.
- Ainsworth EA, Long SP (2005) What Have We Learned from 15 Years of Free-Air CO₂ Enrichment (FACE)? A Meta-Analytic Review of the Responses of Photosynthesis, Canopy Properties and Plant Production to Rising CO₂. *New Phytologist*, **165**, 351–371.
- Ainsworth EA, Rogers A (2007) The response of photosynthesis and stomatal conductance to rising [CO₂]: mechanisms and environmental interactions. *Plant, cell & environment*, **30**, 258–70.
- Ainsworth, E.A., Leakey, A.D.B., Ort, D.R., Long, S.P., Simon, D., Cartieaux, F., Prin, Y. & Silvenite, S. (2013) FACE-Ing the Facts : Inconsistencies and Interdependence among Field , Chamber and Modeling Letters FACE-ing the facts : inconsistencies and interdependence among field , chamber and modeling studies of elevated [CO₂] impacts on crop yield and food supp. *New Phytologist*, **179**, 5–9.
- Albert, C.H., Grassein, F., Schurr, F.M., Vieilledent, G. & Violle, C. (2011) When and how should intraspecific variability be considered in trait-based plant ecology? *Perspectives in Plant Ecology, Evolution and Systematics*, **13**, 217–225.
- Alberto, F.J., Aitken, S.N., Alía, R., González-Martínez, S.C., Hänninen, H., Kremer, A., Lefèvre, F., Lenormand, T., Yeaman, S., Whetten, R. & Savolainen, O. (2013) Potential for evolutionary responses to climate change - evidence from tree populations. *Global Change Biology*, **19**, 1645–1661.
- Ali, A.A., Medlyn, B.E., Aubier, T.G., Crous, K.Y. & Reich, P.B. (2015) Elevated carbon dioxide is predicted to promote coexistence among competing species in a trait-based model. *Ecology and Evolution*, 1–18.
- Austin, A.T. & Zanne, A.E. (2015) Whether in life or in death: fresh perspectives on how plants affect biogeochemical cycling. *Journal of Ecology*, **103**, 1367–1371.
- Baltzer, J.L. & Thomas, S.C. (2007) Determinants of whole-plant light requirements in Bornean rain forest tree saplings. *Journal of Ecology*, **95**, 1208–1221.
- Bazzaz FA, Williams WE (1991) Atmospheric CO₂ Concentrations Within a Mixed Forest : Implications for Seedling Growth. *Ecology*, **72**, 12–16.
- Bazzaz, F.A. (1990) The Response of Natural Ecosystems to the Rising Global CO₂ Levels. *Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics*, **21**, 167–196.
- Becklin, K.M., Medeiros, J.S., Sale, K.R. & Ward, J.K. (2014) Evolutionary history underlies plant physiological responses to global change since the last glacial maximum. *Ecology Letters*, **17**, 691–699.
- Beerling DJ (2012) Atmospheric carbon dioxide: a driver of photosynthetic eukaryote evolution for over a billion years ? *Philosophical transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological sciences*, **367**, 477–482.
- Beerling DJ, Taylor LL, Bradshaw CDC *et al.* (2012) Ecosystem CO₂ starvation and terrestrial silicate weathering: mechanisms and global-scale quantification during the late Miocene. *Journal of Ecology*, **100**, 31–41.

- Beerling, D.J., Taylor, L.L., Bradshaw, C.D.C., Lunt, D.J., Valdes, P.J., Banwart, S.A., Pagani, M. & Leake, J.R. (2012) Ecosystem CO₂ starvation and terrestrial silicate weathering: mechanisms and global-scale quantification during the late Miocene. *Journal of Ecology*, **100**, 31–41.
- Bloom AJ, Chapin FS, Mooney HA (1985) Resource Limitation In Plants - An Economic Analogy. *Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics*, **16**:363–392.
- Bond, W.J. & Midgley, G.F. (2012) Carbon dioxide and the uneasy interactions of trees and savannah grasses. *Philosophical transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological sciences*, **367**, 601–12.
- Bowes G (1993) Facing the inevitable - plants and increasing atmospheric CO₂. *Annual Review of Plant Physiology and Plant Molecular Biology*, **44**, 309–332.
- Brien, R.J.W., Phillips, O.L., Feldpausch, T.R., Gloor, E., Baker, T.R., Lloyd, J., Lopez-Gonzalez, G., Monteagudo-Mendoza, A., Malhi, Y., Lewis, S.L., Vásquez Martínez, R., Alexiades, M., Álvarez Dávila, E., Alvarez-Loayza, P., Andrade, A., Aragão, L.E.O.C., Araujo-Murakami, A., Arets, E.J.M.M., Arroyo, L., Aymard C., G.A., Bánki, O.S., Baraloto, C., Barroso, J., Bonal, D., Boot, R.G.A., Camargo, J.L.C., Castilho, C. V., Chama, V., Chao, K.J., Chave, J., Comiskey, J.A., Cornejo Valverde, F., da Costa, L., de Oliveira, E.A., Di Fiore, A., Erwin, T.L., Fauset, S., Forsthofer, M., Galbraith, D.R., Grahame, E.S., Groot, N., Hérault, B., Higuchi, N., Honorio Coronado, E.N., Keeling, H., Killeen, T.J., Laurance, W.F., Laurance, S., Licona, J., Magnussen, W.E., Marimon, B.S., Marimon-Junior, B.H., Mendoza, C., Neill, D.A., Nogueira, E.M., Núñez, P., Pallqui Camacho, N.C., Parada, A., Pardo-Molina, G., Peacock, J., Peña-Claros, M., Pickavance, G.C., Pitman, N.C.A., Poorter, L., Prieto, A., Quesada, C.A., Ramírez, F., Ramírez-Angulo, H., Restrepo, Z., Roopsind, A., Rudas, A., Salomão, R.P., Schwarz, M., Silva, N., Silva-Espejo, J.E., Silveira, M., Stropp, J., Talbot, J., ter Steege, H., Teran-Aguilar, J., Terborgh, J., Thomas-Caesar, R., Toledo, M., Torello-Raventos, M., Umetsu, R.K., van der Heijden, G.M.F., van der Hout, P., Guimarães Vieira, I.C., Vieira, S.A., Vilanova, E., Vos, V.A. & Zagt, R.J. (2015) Long-term decline of the Amazon carbon sink. *Nature*, **519**, 344–348.
- Brookshire, E.N.J. & Weaver, T. (2015) Long-term decline in grassland productivity driven by increasing dryness. *Nature Communications*, **6**, 7148.
- Campbell CD, Sage RF (2006) Interactions between the effects of atmospheric CO₂ content and P nutrition on photosynthesis in white lupin (*Lupinus albus* L.). *Plant Cell and Environment*, **29**, 844–853.
- Chapin FS, Bloom AJ, Field CB, Waring RH (1987) Plant-responses to multiple environmental-factors. *Bioscience*, **37**, 49–57.
- Chapin FS, Bret-Harte MS, Hobbie SE, Zhong H (1996) Plant functional types as predictors of transient responses of arctic vegetation to global change. *Journal of Vegetation Science*, **7**, 347–358.
- Chapin, F.S., Bloom, A.J., Field, C.B. & Waring, R.H. (1987) Plant Responses to Multiple environmental factors. *BioScience*, **37**, 49–57.
- Chapin, F.S. (1980) The Mineral Nutrition of Wild Plants. *Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics*, **11**, 233–260.
- Choat, B., Jansen, S., Brodribb, T.J., Cochard, H., Delzon, S., Bhaskar, R., Bucci, S.J., Feild, T.S., Gleason, S.M., Hacke, U.G., Jacobsen, A.L., Lens, F., Maherali, H., Martínez-Vilalta, J., Mayr, S., Mencuccini, M., Mitchell, P.J., Nardini, A., Pittermann, J., Pratt, R.B., Sperry, J.S., Westoby, M., Wright, I.J. & Zanne, A.E. (2012) Global convergence in the vulnerability of forests to drought. *Nature*, **491**, 752–5.
- Christin, P.-A. & Osborne, C.P. (2014) The evolutionary ecology of C₄ plants. *New Phytologist*, **204**, 765–781.

- Collins, M., R. Knutti, J. Arblaster et al. (2013) Long-term Climate Change: Projections, Commitments and Irreversibility. In: Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of Working Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change [Stocker, T.F., D. Qin, G.-K. Plattner, M. Tignor, S.K. Allen, J. Boschung, A. Nauels, Y. Xia, V. Bex and P.M. Midgley (eds.)]. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, NY, USA.
- Cornelissen JHC, Castro Diez P, Hunt R (1996) Seedling growth, allocation and leaf attributes in a wide range of woody plant species and types. *Journal of Ecology*, **84**, 755–765.
- Cornelissen JHC, Perez-Harguindeguy N, Diaz S *et al.* (1999) Leaf structure and defence control litter decomposition rate across species and life forms in regional floras on two continents. *New Phytologist*, **143**, 191–200.
- Cornelissen, J., Carnelli, A. & Callaghan, T. (1999) Generalities in the growth, allocation and leaf quality responses to elevated CO₂ in eight woody species. *New Phytologist*, **141**, 401–409.
- Cornelissen, J.H.C., Werger, M.J.A., Castro-Díez, P., Van Rheenen, J.W.A. & Rowland, A.P. (1997) Foliar nutrients in relation to growth, allocation and leaf traits in seedlings of a wide range of woody plant species and types. *Oecologia*, **111**, 460–469.
- Cowling SA, Sage RF (1998) Interactive effects of low atmospheric CO₂ and elevated temperature on growth, photosynthesis and respiration in *Phaseolus vulgaris*. *Plant, Cell and Environment*, **21**, 427–435.
- Cowling SA (2001) Plant carbon balance, evolutionary innovation and extinction in land plants. *Global Change Biology*, **7**, 231–239.
- Cunniff J, Osborne CP, Ripley BS, Charles M, Jones G (2008) Response of wild C-4 crop progenitors to subambient CO₂ highlights a possible role in the origin of agriculture. *Global Change Biology*, **14**, 576–587.
- Curtis PS, Wang X (1998) A meta-analysis of elevated CO₂ effects on woody plant mass, form, and physiology. *Oecologia*, **113**, 299–313.
- de Boer, H.J., Eppinga, M.B., Wassen, M.J. & Dekker, S.C. (2012) A critical transition in leaf evolution facilitated the Cretaceous angiosperm revolution. *Nature communications*, **3**, 1221.
- Diaz S, Hodgson JG, Thompson K et al. (2004) The plant traits that drive ecosystems: Evidence from three continents. *Journal Of Vegetation Science*, **15**, 295–304.
- Díaz, S., Grime, J.P., Harris, J. & McPherson, E. (1993) Evidence of a feedback mechanism limiting plant response to elevated carbon dioxide. *Nature*, **364**, 616–617.
- Dow, G.J., Bergmann, D.C. & Berry, J. a. (2014) An integrated model of stomatal development and leaf physiology. *New Phytologist*, **201**, 1218–1226.
- Drake, P.L., Froend, R.H. & Franks, P.J. (2013) Smaller, faster stomata: scaling of stomatal size, rate of response, and stomatal conductance. *Journal of Experimental Botany*, **64**, 495–505.
- Edwards, E.J., Osborne, C.P., Strömberg, C.A.E., Smith, S. a, Bond, W.J., Christin, P.-A., Cousins, A.B., Duvall, M.R., Fox, D.L., Freckleton, R.P., Ghannoum, O., Hartwell, J., Huang, Y., Janis, C.M., Keeley, J.E., Kellogg, E. a, Knapp, A.K., Leakey, A.D.B., Nelson, D.M., Saarela, J.M., Sage, R.F., Sala, O.E., Salamin, N., Still, C.J. & Tiplle, B. (2010) The origins of C₄ grasslands: integrating evolutionary and ecosystem science. *Science*, **328**, 587–91.
- Ehleringer JR, Cerling TE (1995) Atmospheric CO(2) and the ratio of intercellular to ambient CO(2) concentrations in plants. *Tree Physiol*, **15**, 105–111.
- Evans GC. 1972. The quantitative analysis of plant growth. Oxford: Blackwell Scientific

- Evans JR, Poorter H (2001) Photosynthetic acclimation of plants to growth irradiance: The relative importance of specific leaf area and nitrogen partitioning in maximizing carbon gain. *Plant, Cell and Environment*, **24**, 755–767.
- Farquhar GD, Caemmerer SV, Berry JA (1980) A Biochemical-Model Of Photosynthetic CO₂ Assimilation In Leaves Of C-3 Species. *Planta*, **149**, 78–90.
- Farquhar GD, Sharkey TD (1982) Stomatal Conductance And Photosynthesis. *Annual Review of Plant Physiology and Plant Molecular Biology*, **33**, 317–345.
- Fatichi, S., Leuzinger, S. & Körner, C. (2013) Moving beyond photosynthesis: from carbon source to sink-driven vegetation modeling. *New Phytologist*, **4**, 1086–1095
- Feng, Z., Rütting, T., Pleijel, H., Wallin, G., Reich, P.B., Kammann, C.I., Newton, P.C.D., Kobayashi, K., Luo, Y. & Uddling, J. (2015) Constraints to Nitrogen Acquisition of Terrestrial Plants under Elevated CO₂. *Global Change Biology*, **8**, 3152–3168
- Frank, DA McNaughton, S.J. (1992) The Ecology of Plants , Large Mammalian Herbivores , and Drought in Yellowstone National Park. *Ecology*, **73**, 2043–2058.
- Franks, P.J. Beerling, D.J. (2009) Maximum leaf conductance driven by CO₂ effects on stomatal size and density over geologic time. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*, **106**, 10343–7.
- Franks, P.J., Adams, M. A, Amthor, J.S., Barbour, M.M., Berry, J. A, Ellsworth, D.S., Farquhar, G.D., Ghannoum, O., Lloyd, J., McDowell, N., Norby, R.J., Tissue, D.T. & von Caemmerer, S. (2013) Sensitivity of plants to changing atmospheric CO₂ concentration: from the geological past to the next century. *The New phytologist*, **197**, 1077–94.
- Franks, P.J., Royer, D.L., Beerling, D.J., Water, P.K. Van De & Cantrill, D.J. (2014) New constraints on atmospheric CO₂ concentration for the Phanerozoic. *Geophysical Research Letters*, **41**, 4685–4694.
- Freschet, G.T., Cornelissen, J.H.C., van Logtestijn, R.S.P., Aerts, R. 2010. Evidence of the ‘plant economics spectrum’ in a subarctic flora. *J. Ecol.* **98**:362–373.
- Freschet, G.T., Aerts, R. & Cornelissen, J.H.C. (2012) A plant economics spectrum of litter decomposability. *Functional Ecology*, **26**, 56–65.
- Gerhart LM, Harris JM, Nippert JB, Sandquist DR, Ward JK (2012) Glacial trees from the La Brea tar pits show physiological constraints of low CO₂. *New Phytologist*, **194**, 63–69.
- Gerhart LM, Ward JK (2010) Plant responses to low [CO₂] of the past. *New Phytologist*, **188**, 674–695.
- Ghannoum O, Von Caemmerer S, Ziska LH, Conroy JP (2000) The growth response of C-4 plants to rising atmospheric CO₂ partial pressure: a reassessment. *Plant Cell and Environment*, **23**, 931–942.
- Gill RA, Polley HW, Johnson HB, Anderson LJ, Maherali H, Jackson RB (2002) Nonlinear grassland responses to past and future atmospheric CO₂. *Nature*, **417**, 279–82.
- Grime JP (2006) Trait convergence and trait divergence in herbaceous plant communities: Mechanisms and consequences. *Journal of Vegetation Science*, **17**, 255–260.
- Grime, J.P. & Hunt, R. (1975) Relative Growth-Rate: Its Range and Adaptive Significance in a Local Flora. *The Journal of Ecology*, **63**, 393.
- Grunzweig JM, Korner C (2003) Differential phosphorus and nitrogen effects drive species and community responses to elevated CO₂ in semi-arid grassland. *Functional Ecology*, **17**, 766–777.

- Hallik, L., Niinemets, Æ. & Wright, I.J. (2009) Are species shade and drought tolerance reflected in leaf-level structural and functional differentiation in Northern Hemisphere temperate woody flora? *New Phytologist*, **184**, 257–274.
- Hartmann, H., Ziegler, W., Kolle, O. & Trumbore, S. (2013) Thirst beats hunger - declining hydration during drought prevents carbon starvation in Norway spruce saplings. *New Phytologist*, **200**, 340–349.
- Hattenschwiler S, Korner C (2000) Tree seedling responses to in situ CO₂-enrichment differ among species and depend on understorey light availability. *Global Change Biology*, **6**, 213–226.
- Haworth, M., Elliott-Kingston, C. & McElwain, J.C. (2013) Co-ordination of physiological and morphological responses of stomata to elevated [CO₂] in vascular plants. *Oecologia*, **171**, 71–82.
- He, M. & Dijkstra, F.A. (2014) Drought effect on plant nitrogen and phosphorus : a meta- analysis. *New Phytologist*, **204**, 924–931.
- Hedges LV, Olkin I (1985) *Statistical methods for meta-analysis*, Academic Press.
- Hoffmann WA, Poorter H (2002) Avoiding Bias in Calculations of Relative Growth Rate. *Annals of Botany*, **80**, 37–42.
- Honisch B, Hemming NG, Archer D, Siddall M, Mcmanus JF (2009) Atmospheric Carbon Dioxide Concentration Across the Mid-Pleistocene Transition. *Science*, **324**, 1551–1554.
- Huang, Y., Shuman, B., Wang, Y., Webb, T., Grimm, E.C. & Jacobson, G.L. (2006) Climatic and environmental controls on the variation of C₃ and C₄ plant abundances in central Florida for the past 62,000 years. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*, **237**, 428–435.
- Hungate, B. A., Dijkstra, P., Wu, Z., Duval, B.D., Day, F.P., Johnson, D.W., Megonigal, J.P., Brown, A.L.P. & Garland, J.L. (2013) Cumulative response of ecosystem carbon and nitrogen stocks to chronic CO₂ exposure in a subtropical oak woodland. *New Phytologist*, **3**, 753–766.
- IPCC 2007 Solomon, S, Qin, D, Manning, M, Chen, Z, Marquis, M, Averyt, KB, Tignor, M, Millerm HL, eds. *Climate Change 2007: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of Working Group I to the Fourth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change*. Cambridge, UK & New York, NY, USA: Cambridge University Press.
- IPCC 2015 Ciais, P., C. Sabine, G. Bala, L. Bopp, V. Brovkin, J. Canadell, A. Chhabra, R. De-Fries, J. Galloway, M. Heimann, C. Jones, C. Le Quéré, R.B. Myneni, S. Piao and P. Thornton, 2013: Carbon and Other Biogeochemical Cycles. In: *Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of Working Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change* [Stocker, T.F., D. Qin, G.-K. Plattner, M. Tignor, S.K. Allen, J. Boschung, A. Nauels, Y. Xia, V. Bex and P.M. Midgley (eds.)]. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, NY, USA.
- Jablonski, L.M., Wang, X. & Curtis, P.S. (2002) Plant reproduction under elevated CO₂ conditions: A meta-analysis of reports on 79 crop and wild species. *New Phytologist*, **156**, 9–26.
- Jin, J., Lauricella, D., Armstrong, R., Sale, P. & Tang, C. (2014) Phosphorus application and elevated CO₂ enhance drought tolerance in field pea grown in a phosphorus-deficient vertisol. *Annals of botany*, 975–985.
- Keenan T, Sabate S, Gracia C (2010) The importance of mesophyll conductance in regulating forest ecosystem productivity during drought periods. *Global Change Biology*, **16**, 1019–1034.
- Kelly, J.W.G., Duursma, R.A., Atwell, B.J., Tissue, D.T. & Medlyn, B.E. (2015) Drought × CO₂ interactions in trees: a test of the low-intercellular CO₂ concentration (Ci) mechanism. *New Phytologist*,

- Kerstiens G, Hawes CV (1994) Response of growth and carbon allocation to elevated CO₂ in young cherry (*Prunus avium* L.) saplings in relation to root environment. *New Phytologist*, **128**, 607–614.
- Kgope BS, Bond WJ, Midgley GF (2010) Growth responses of African savanna trees implicate atmospheric CO₂ as a driver of past and current changes in savanna tree cover. *Austral Ecology*, **35**, 451–463.
- Korner C (2000) Biosphere Responses to CO₂ Enrichment. *Ecological Applications*, **10**, 1590–1619.
- Körner, C. (2015) Paradigm shift in plant growth control. *Current Opinion in Plant Biology*, **25**, 107–114.
- Lambers H, Poorter H (1992) Inherent Variation in Growth Rate Between Higher Plants: A Search for Physiological Causes and Ecological Consequences. *Advances in Ecological Research*, **23**, 187–261.
- Lammertsma, E.I., de Boer, H.J., Dekker, S.C., Dilcher, D.L., Lotter, A.F. & Wagner-Cremer, F. (2011) Global CO₂ rise leads to reduced maximum stomatal conductance in Florida vegetation. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*, **108**, 4035–40.
- Leakey ADB, Lau JA (2012) Evolutionary context for understanding and manipulating plant responses to past, present and future atmospheric [CO₂]. *Philosophical transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological sciences*, **367**, 613–629.
- Lee TD, Barrott SH, Reich PB (2011) Photosynthetic responses of 13 grassland species across 11 years of free-air CO₂ enrichment is modest, consistent and independent of N supply. *Global Change Biology*, **17**, 2893–2904.
- Lewis JD, Ward JK, Tissue DT (2010) Phosphorus supply drives nonlinear responses of cottonwood (*Populus deltoides*) to increases in CO₂ concentration from glacial to future concentrations. *The New phytologist*, **187**, 438–48.
- Liu, J.C., Temme, A.A., Cornwell, W.K., van Logtestijn, R.S.P., Aerts, R & Cornelissen, J.H.C. Does plant size matter to growth responses to water availability at glacial, modern and future CO₂ concentrations? *Ecological Research*, in press.
- Loik ME, Holl KD (2001) Photosynthetic responses of tree seedlings in grass and under shrubs in early-successional tropical old fields, Costa Rica. *Oecologia*, **127**, 40–50.
- Loreto F, Harley PC, Dimarco G, Sharkey TD (1992) Estimation Of Mesophyll Conductance To CO₂ Flux By 3 Different Methods. *Plant Physiology*, **98**, 1437–1443.
- Lusk, C.H., Reich, P.B., Montgomery, R.A., Ackerly, D.D. & Cavender-Bares, J. (2008) Why are evergreen leaves so contrary about shade? *TRENDS IN ECOLOGY & EVOLUTION*, **23**, 299–303.
- Lüthi, D., Le Floch, M., Bereiter, B., Blunier, T., Barnola, J.-M., Siegenthaler, U., Raynaud, D., Jouzel, J., Fischer, H., Kawamura, K. & Stocker, T.F. (2008) High-resolution carbon dioxide concentration record 650,000–800,000 years before present. *Nature*, **453**, 379–82.
- Makino A, Nakano H, Mae T, Shimada T, Yamamoto N (2000) Photosynthesis , plant growth and N allocation in transgenic rice plants with decreased Rubisco under CO enrichment. *Journal of experimental botany*, **51**, 383–389.
- Mayeux, H.S., Johnson, H.B., Polley, W.H., Dumesnil, M.J. & Spanel, G.A. (1993) A controlled environment chamber for growing plants across a subambient CO₂ gradient. *Functional Ecology*, **7**, 125–133.
- McElwain JC, Beerling DJ, Woodward FI (1999) Fossil Plants and Global Warming at the Triassic-Jurassic Boundary. *Science*, **285**, 1386–1390.

- McElwain JC, Willis KJ, Lupia R (2005) Cretaceous CO₂ Decline and the Radiation and Diversification of Angiosperms. In: *A history of atmospheric CO₂ and its effects on plants, animals, and ecosystems* (eds Ehleringer JR, Cerling TE, Dearing MD), pp 133-165. Springer, New York.
- McMahon, S.M., Harrison, S.P., Armbruster, W.S., Bartlein, P.J., Beale, C.M., Edwards, M.E., Kattge, J., Midgley, G., Morin, X. & Prentice, I.C. (2011) Improving assessment and modelling of climate change impacts on global terrestrial biodiversity. *Trends in Ecology & Evolution*, **26**, 249–259.
- Medeiros JS, Ward JK (2013) Increasing atmospheric [CO₂] from glacial to future concentrations affects drought tolerance via impacts on leaves, xylem and their integrated function. *The New phytologist*, **199**, 738–48.
- Medina E, Montes G, Cuevas E, Rokzandic Z (1986) Profiles of CO₂ concentration and $\delta^{13}C$ values in tropical rain forests of the upper Rio Negro Basin, Venezuela. *Journal of Tropical Ecology*, **2**, 207-217.
- Medlyn BE, Duursma RA, Eamus D *et al.* (2011) Reconciling the optimal and empirical approaches to modelling stomatal conductance. *Global Change Biology*, **17**, 2134-2144.
- Medlyn, B.E. & McMurtrie, R.E. (2005) Effects of CO₂ on plants at different timescales. *A History of Atmospheric CO₂ and Its Effects on Plants, Animals, and Ecosystems* (eds J.R. Ehleringer, T.E. Cerling & M.D. Dearing), pp. 441–467.
- Meinshausen, M., Smith, S.J., Calvin, K., Daniel, J.S., Kainuma, M.L.T., Lamarque, J.-F., Matsumoto, K., Montzka, S. a., Raper, S.C.B., Riahi, K., Thomson, a., Velders, G.J.M. & Vuuren, D.P.P. (2011) The RCP greenhouse gas concentrations and their extensions from 1765 to 2300. *Climatic Change*, **109**, 213–241.
- Milla, R. & Reich, P.B. (2007) The scaling of leaf area and mass: the cost of light interception increases with leaf size. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences*, **274**, 2109–2115.
- Mohan J, Clark J., Schlesinger W. (2004) Genetic variation in germination , growth , and survivorship of red maple in response to subambient through elevated atmospheric CO 2. *Global change biology*, **10**, 233–247.
- Newingham, B. A., Vanier, C.H., Charlet, T.N., Ogle, K., Smith, S.D. & Nowak, R.S. (2013) No cumulative effect of 10 years of elevated [CO₂] on perennial plant biomass components in the Mojave Desert. *Global Change Biology*, **19**, 2168–2181.
- Nicotra, AB., Atkin, O.K., Bonser, S.P., Davidson, a M., Finnegan, E.J., Mathesius, U., Poot, P., Purugganan, M.D., Richards, C.L., Valladares, F. & van Kleunen, M. (2010) Plant phenotypic plasticity in a changing climate. *Trends in plant science*, **15**, 684–92.
- Niinemets, Ü. (2015) Is there a species spectrum within the world-wide leaf economics spectrum ? Major variations in leaf functional traits in the Mediterranean sclerophyll *Quercus ilex*. *New Phytologist*, **205**, 79–96.
- Norby, R.J. & Zak, D.R. (2011) Ecological Lessons from Free-Air CO₂ Enrichment (FACE) Experiments. *Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics*, **42**, 181–203.
- Norby, R.J., Cotrufo, M.F., Ineson, P., O'Neill, E.G. & Canadell, J.G. (2001) Elevated CO₂, litter chemistry, and decomposition: a synthesis. *Oecologia*, **127**, 153–165.
- O'Grady, A.P., Mitchell, P.J.M., Pinkard, E. a. & Tissue, D.T. (2013) Thirsty roots and hungry leaves: Unravelling the roles of carbon and water dynamics in tree mortality. *New Phytologist*, **200**, 294–297.

- Onoda, Y., Hirose, T. & Hikosaka, K. (2009) Does leaf photosynthesis adapt to CO₂-enriched environments? An experiment on plants originating from three natural CO₂ springs. *New Phytologist*, **182**, 698–709.
- Ouédraogo, D.Y., Mortier, F., Gourlet-Fleury, S., Freycon, V. & Picard, N. (2013) Slow-growing species cope best with drought: Evidence from long-term measurements in a tropical semi-deciduous moist forest of Central Africa. *Journal of Ecology*, **101**, 1459–1470.
- Overdieck D, Reid C, Strain BR (1988) The Effects Of Preindustrial And Future CO₂ Concentrations On Growth, Dry-Matter Production And The C/N Relationship In Plants At Low Nutrient Supply - Vigna-Unguiculata (Cowpea), Abelmoschus-Esculentus (Okra) And Raphanus-Sativus (Radish). *Angewandte Botanik*, **62**, 119–134.
- Parlange, J.Y. & Waggoner, P.E. (1970) Stomatal Dimensions and Resistance to Diffusion. *Plant Physiology*, **46**, 337–342.
- Parmesan, C. & Hanley, M.E. (2015) Plants and climate change: complexities and surprises. *Annals of Botany*, **116**, 849–864.
- Peng, C., Ma, Z., Lei, X., Zhu, Q., Chen, H., Wang, W., Liu, S., Li, W., Fang, X. & Zhou, X. (2011) A drought-induced pervasive increase in tree mortality across Canada's boreal forests. *Nature Climate Change*, **1**, 467–471.
- Pérez-Harguindeguy N, Díaz S, Vendramini F, Cornelissen JHC, Gurvich DE, Cabido M (2003) Leaf traits and herbivore selection in the field and in cafeteria experiments. *Austral Ecology*, **28**, 642–650.
- Peters W, Jacobson AR, Sweeney C et al. (2007) An atmospheric perspective on North American carbon dioxide exchange: CarbonTracker. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*, **104**, 18925–30.
- Petit, R.J., Raynaud, D., Basile, I., Chappellaz, J., Ritz, C., Delmotte, M., Legrand, M., Lorius, C. & Pe, L. (1999) Climate and atmospheric history of the past 420,000 years from the Vostok ice core, Antarctica. *Nature*, **399**, 429–413.
- Pieruschka, R. & Poorter, H. (2012) Phenotyping plants: genes, phenes and machines. *Functional Plant Biology*, **39**, 813–820.
- Polley, H.W., Johnson, H.B. & Mayeux, H.S. (1995) Nitrogen and Water Requirements of C₃ Plants Grown at Glacial to Present Carbon Dioxide Concentrations. *Functional Ecology*, **9**, 86–96.
- Polley, W.H., Johnson, H.B., Mayeux, H.S. & Malone, S.R. (1993) Physiology and Growth of Wheat Across a Subambient Carbon Dioxide Gradient. *Annals of Botany*, **71**, 347–356.
- Poorter H (1993) Interspecific Variation In The Growth-Response Of Plants To An Elevated Ambient CO₂ Concentration. *Vegetatio*, **104**, 77–97.
- Poorter H, Bühler J, van Dusschoten D, Climent J, Postma J a. (2012a) Pot size matters: a meta-analysis of the effects of rooting volume on plant growth. *Functional Plant Biology*, **39**, 839.
- Poorter H, Garnier E (2007) Ecological Significance of Inherent Variation in Relative Growth Rate and Its Components. In: *Functional Plant Ecology*, Vol. 000 (eds Pugnaire FI, Valladares F), pp. 67–100. CRC press, Boca Raton.
- Poorter H, Navas M-L (2003) Plant growth and competition at elevated CO₂: on winners, losers and functional groups. *New Phytologist*, **157**, 175–198.
- Poorter H, Niinemets U, Poorter L, Wright IJ, Villar R (2009) Causes and consequences of variation in leaf mass per area (LMA): a meta-analysis. *New Phytologist*, **182**, 565–588.

- Poorter H, Niklas KJ, Reich PB, Oleksyn J, Poot P, Mommer L (2012b) Biomass allocation to leaves, stems and roots: meta-analyses of interspecific variation and environmental control. *The New phytologist*, **193**, 30–50.
- Poorter H, Pérez-Soba M (2001) The growth response of plants to elevated CO₂ under non-optimal environmental conditions. *Oecologia*, **129**, 1–20.
- Poorter, H. & Nagel, O. (2000) The role of biomass allocation in the growth response of plants to different levels of light, CO₂, nutrients and water: a quantitative review. *Australian Journal of Plant Physiology*, **27**, 1191.
- Poorter, H., Anten, N.P.R. & Marcelis, L.F.M. (2013) Physiological mechanisms in plant growth models: do we need a supra-cellular systems biology approach? *Plant, cell & environment*, **36**, 1673–90.
- Poorter, H., Jagodzinski, A.M., Ruiz-Peinado, R., Kuyah, S., Luo, Y., Oleksyn, J., Usoltsev, V. a., Buckley, T.N., Reich, P.B. & Sack, L. (2015) How does biomass distribution change with size and differ among species? An analysis for 1200 plant species from five continents. *New Phytologist*,
- Poorter, H., Lambers, H. & Evans, J.R. (2014) Trait correlation networks: a whole-plant perspective on the recently criticized leaf economic spectrum. *New Phytologist*, **201**, 378–382.
- Poorter, H., Niinemets, Ü., Poorter, L., Wright, I.J. & Villar, R. (2009) Causes and consequences of variation in leaf mass per area (LMA): a meta-analysis. *New Phytologist*, **182**, 565–588.
- Prentice, I.C. & Harrison, S.P. (2009) Ecosystem effects of CO₂ concentration: evidence from past climates. *Climate of the Past*, **5**, 297–307.
- Prentice, I.C., Harrison, S.P. & Bartlein, P.J. (2011) Global vegetation and terrestrial carbon cycle changes after the last ice age. *New Phytologist*, **189**, 988–998.
- Quirk, J., McDowell, N.G., Leake, J.R., Hudson, P.J. & Beerling, D.J. (2013) Increased susceptibility to drought-induced mortality in *Sequoia sempervirens* (Cupressaceae) trees under Cenozoic atmospheric carbon dioxide starvation. *American Journal of Botany*, **100**, 582–591.
- Raven, J. a. (2014) Speedy small stomata? *Journal of Experimental Botany*, **65**, 1415–1424.
- Ray, J.D. & Sinclair, T.R. (1998) The Effect of Pot Size on Growth and Transpiration of Maize and Soybean During Water Deficit Stress. *Journal of Experimental Botany*, **49**, 1381–1386.
- Reich PB (2014) The world-wide “fast-slow” plant economics spectrum: a traits manifesto (ed Cornelissen H). *Journal of Ecology*, **102**, 275–301.
- Reich, P.B., Hobbie, S.E., Lee, T., Ellsworth, D.S., West, J.B., Tilman, D., Knops, J.M.H., Naeem, S. & Trost, J. (2006) Nitrogen limitation constrains sustainability of ecosystem response to CO₂. *Nature*, **440**, 922–5.
- Renton M, Poorter H (2011) Using log–log scaling slope analysis for determining the contributions to variability in biological variables such as leaf mass per area: why it works, when it works and how it can be extended. *New Phytologist*, **190**, 5–8.
- Ripley BS, Cunniff J, Osborne CP (2013) Photosynthetic acclimation and resource use by the C₃ and C₄ subspecies of *Allotropa semialata* in low CO₂ atmospheres. *GLOBAL CHANGE BIOLOGY*, **19**, 900–910.
- Royer DL (2006) CO₂-forced climate thresholds during the Phanerozoic. *Geochimica Et Cosmochimica Acta*, **70**, 5665–5675.
- Royer, D.L. (2001) Stomatal density and stomatal index as indicators of paleoatmospheric CO₂ concentration. *Review of palaeobotany and palynology*, **114**, 1–28.

- Royer, D.L., Sack, L., Wilf, P., Lusk, C.H., Jordan, G.J., Niinemets, Ü., Wright, I.J., Westoby, M., Cariglino, B., Coley, P.D., Cutter, A.D., Johnson, K.R., Labandeira, C.C., Moles, A.T., Palmer, M.B. & Valladares, F. (2007) Fossil leaf economics quantified: calibration, Eocene case study, and implications. *Paleobiology*, **33**, 574–589.
- Sack, L., Scoffoni, C., John, G.P., Poorter, H., Mason, C.M., Mendez-Alonzo, R. & Donovan, L. a. (2013) How do leaf veins influence the worldwide leaf economic spectrum? Review and synthesis. *Journal of Experimental Botany*, **64**, 4053–4080.
- Sage R (1994) Acclimation of photosynthesis to increasing atmospheric CO₂: The gas exchange perspective. *Photosynthesis Research*, **39**, 351–368.
- Sage RF (1995) Was low atmospheric CO₂ during the Pleistocene a limiting factor for the origin of agriculture? *Global change biology*, **1**, 93–106.
- Sage RF, Coleman JR (2001) Effects of low atmospheric CO(2) on plants: more than a thing of the past. *Trends in plant science*, **6**, 18–24.
- Sage RF, Reid CD (1992) Photosynthetic Acclimation To Sub-Ambient CO₂ (20 Pa) In The C₃ Annual Phaseolus-Vulgaris L. *Photosynthetica*, **27**, 605–617.
- Sitch, S., Huntingford, C., Gedney, N., Levy, P.E., Lomas, M., Piao, S.L., Betts, R., Ciais, P., Cox, P., Friedlingstein, P., Jones, C.D., Prentice, I.C. & Woodward, F.I. (2008) Evaluation of the terrestrial carbon cycle, future plant geography and climate-carbon cycle feedbacks using five Dynamic Global Vegetation Models (DGVMs). *Global Change Biology*, **14**, 2015–2039.
- Smith RA, Lewis JD, Ghannoum O, Tissue DT (2012) Leaf structural responses to pre-industrial, current and elevated atmospheric {[}CO₂] and temperature affect leaf function in Eucalyptus sideroxylon. *Functional Plant Biology*, **39**, 285–296.
- Smith, S.D., Charlet, T.N., Zitzer, S.F., Abella, S.R., Vanier, C.H. & Huxman, T.E. (2014) Long-term response of a Mojave Desert winter annual plant community to a whole-ecosystem atmospheric CO₂ manipulation (FACE). *Global Change Biology*, **20**, 879–892.
- Sokal, R. R., and F. J. Rohlf. 1995. Biometry: the principles and practice of statistics in biological research. W. H. Freeman, New York
- Sperry, J.S. & Love, D.M. (2015) What plant hydraulics can tell us about responses to climate-change droughts. *New Phytologist*, **207**, 14–27.
- Steinkamp, J. & Hickler, T. (2015) Is drought-induced forest dieback globally increasing ? *Journal of Ecology*, 31–43.
- Tardieu, F. (2012) Any trait or trait-related allele can confer drought tolerance: just design the right drought scenario. *Journal of experimental botany*, **63**, 25–31.
- Temme, A.A., Cornwell, W.K., Cornelissen, J.H.C. & Aerts, R. (2013) Meta-analysis reveals profound responses of plant traits to glacial CO₂ levels. *Ecology and Evolution*, **3**, 4525–4535.
- Temme, A.A., Liu, J.C., Cornwell, W.K., Cornelissen, J.H.C. & Aerts, R. (2015) Winners always win: growth of a wide range of plant species from low to future high CO₂. *Ecology and Evolution*, **5**, 4949–4961.
- The Plant List. URL <http://www.theplantlist.org/> [accessed 13 December 2015]
- Tissue, D.T. & Lewis, J.D. (2012) Learning from the past: how low [CO₂] studies inform plant and ecosystem response to future climate change. *New Phytologist*, **194**, 4–6.
- Tummers B (2006) DataThief III (<http://datathief.org>)

- Verheijen, L.M., Aerts, R., Brovkin, V., Cavender-Bares, J., Cornelissen, J.H.C., Kattge, J. & van Bodegom, P.M. (2015a) Inclusion of ecologically based trait variation in plant functional types reduces the projected land carbon sink in an earth system model. *Global Change Biology*, **8**, 3074–3086
- Verheijen, L.M., Aerts, R., Gerhard, B., Kattge, J. & Bodegom, P.M. Van. (2015b) Variation in trait trade-offs allows differentiation among predefined plant functional types: implications for predictive ecology. *New Phytologist*.
- Villa-Vialaneix, N., Liaubet, L., Laurent, T., Cherel, P., Gamot, A. & SanCristobal, M. (2013) The structure of a gene co-expression network reveals biological functions underlying eQTLs. *PLoS one*, **8**, e60045.
- Violle, C., Navas, M.-L., Vile, D., Kazakou, E., Fortunel, C., Hummel, I. & Garnier, E. (2007) Let the concept of trait be functional! *Oikos*, **116**, 882–892.
- Vitousek PM, Field CB, Matson PA (1990) Variation in foliar $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ in Hawaiian *Metrosideros polymorpha*: a case of internal resistance? *Oecologia*, **84**, 362–370.
- Voelker, S.L., Brooks, J.R., Meinzer, F.C., Anderson, R., Bader, M.K.-F., Battipaglia, G., Becklin, K.M., Beerling, D., Bert, D., Betancourt, J.L., Dawson, T.E., Domec, J.-C., Guyette, R.P., Körner, C., Leavitt, S.W., Linder, S., Marshall, J.D., Mildner, M., Ogée, J., Panyushkina, I., Plumpton, H.J., Pregitzer, K.S., Saurer, M., Smith, A.R., Siegwolf, R.T.W., Stambaugh, M.C., Talhelm, A.F., Tardif, J.C., Van de Water, P.K., Ward, J.K. & Wingate, L. (2015) A dynamic leaf gas-exchange strategy is conserved in woody plants under changing ambient CO_2 : evidence from carbon isotope discrimination in paleo and CO_2 enrichment studies. *Global Change Biology*, n/a–n/a.
- Wang D, Heckathorn SA, Wang X, Philpott SM (2012) A meta-analysis of plant physiological and growth responses to temperature and elevated CO_2 . *Oecologia*, **169**, 1–13.
- Ward JK, Antonovics J, Thomas RB, Strain BR (2000) Is atmospheric CO_2 a selective agent on model C₃ annuals? *Oecologia*, **123**, 330–341.
- Ward JK, Myers DA, Thomas RB (2008) Physiological and growth responses of C₃ and C₄ plants to reduced temperature when grown at low CO_2 of the last ice age. *Journal of integrative plant biology*, **50**, 1388–95.
- Ward JK, Tissue DT, Thomas RB, Strain BR (1999) Comparative responses of model C₃ and C₄ plants to drought in low and elevated CO_2 . *Global Change Biology*, **5**, 857–867.
- Ward, J.K., Tissue, D.T., Thomas, R.B. & Strain, B.R. (1999) Comparative responses of model C₃ and C₄ plants to drought in low and elevated CO_2 . *Global Change Biology*, **5**, 857–867.
- Warren, J.M., Elisabeth, P., Wullschleger, S.D., Thornton, P.E., Hasenauer, H. & Norby, R.J. (2011) Ecohydrologic impact of reduced stomatal conductance in forests exposed to elevated CO_2 . *Ecolhydrology*, **4**, 196–210.
- Westoby, M., Reich, P.B. & Wright, I.J. (2013) Understanding ecological variation across species: Area-based vs mass-based expression of leaf traits. *New Phytologist*, **199**, 322–323.
- Woodward, F.I. (1987) Stomatal numbers are sensitive to increases in CO_2 from pre-industrial levels. *Nature*, **327**, 617–618.
- Wright, I.J., Reich, P.B., Westoby, M., Ackerly, D.D., Baruch, Z., Bongers, F., Cavender-bares, J., Chapin, T., Cornelissen, J.H.C., Diemer, M., Flexas, J., Garnier, E., Groom, P.K., Gulias, J., Hikosaka, K., Lamont, B.B., Lee, T., Lee, W., Lusk, C., Midgley, J.J., Navas, M.-L., Niinemets, U., Oleksyn, J., Osada, N., Poorter, H., Poot, P., Prior, L., Pyankov, V.I., Roumet, C., Thomas, S.C., Tjoelker, M.G., Veneklaas, E.J. & Villar, R. (2004) The worldwide leaf economics spectrum. *Nature*, **428**, 821–827.

- Yashina S, Gubin S, Maksimovich S, Yashina A, Gakhova E, Gilichinsky D (2012) Regeneration of whole fertile plants from 30,000-y-old fruit tissue buried in Siberian permafrost. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*. **109**, 4008–4013.
- Zhu, X.G., Portis, A.R. & Long, S.P. (2004) Would transformation of C₃ crop plants with foreign Rubisco increase productivity? A computational analysis extrapolating from kinetic properties to canopy photosynthesis. *Plant, Cell & Environment*, 155–165.
- Zwicke, M., Picon-Cochard, C., Morvan-Bertrand, A., Prud'homme, M.-P. & Volaire, F. (2015) What functional strategies drive drought survival and recovery of perennial species from upland grassland? *Annals of Botany*, 1001–1015.

